IN RE INTEL CORP. MICROPROCESSOR ANTITRUST LITIGATION)))) MDL No. 05-1717-JJF))
PHIL PAUL, on behalf of himself and all others similarly situated,)
Plaintiffs,)
v.) Civil Action No. 05-485-JJF
INTEL CORPORATION,) CONSOLIDATED ACTION
Defendant.)))

NOTICE OF CLASS PLAINTIFFS' RESPONSE TO DEFENDANT INTEL CORPORATION'S SUPPLEMENTAL FILING

Intel's reliance on *Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly*, 127 S. Ct. 1955 (2007), is misplaced. That case addressed "the proper standard for pleading an antitrust conspiracy" *Id.* at 1963; *see also id.* at 1964 ("This case presents the . . . question of what a plaintiff must plead in order to state a claim under § 1 of the Sherman Act."). It provides no guidance here in determining the adequacy of Class Plaintiffs' complaint, which alleges that Intel engaged in unlawful monopolization, not an antitrust conspiracy. ¹

¹ To be sure, Intel's anticompetitive conduct included agreements with customers and standards-setting bodies that enabled Intel to maintain monopoly power and charge supra-competitive prices in the x86 microprocessor market. See FACC ¶¶ 249-51, D.I. 108 in 05-MD-1717. But the complaint pleads these agreements in detail, see id. ¶¶ 140-225, and Intel's motion does not argue otherwise. Indeed, as to some of these agreements – those with the five major Japanese OEMs – Intel did not contest the Japan Fair Trade Commission's findings that the agreements existed and violated Japan's Antimonopoly Act. See id. ¶¶ 145-49. In contrast, the complaint in

In deciding whether Class Plaintiffs' complaint sufficiently pleads a monopolization claim, this Court should look not to *Twombly* but to cases such as *Brader v. Allegheny Gen. Hosp.*, 64 F.3d 869 (3d Cir. 1995). Intel's challenge to Class Plaintiffs' monopolization claim targets their allegations regarding antitrust injury and standing to sue. On this issue, the Third Circuit Court of Appeals has stated that "the existence of an 'antitrust injury' is not typically resolved through motions to dismiss." *Id.* at 876. As Class Plaintiffs explained in their opposition brief, determining whether consumers in fact paid higher prices than they would have paid but for Intel's unlawful conduct requires expert analysis, supporting data, and other evidence. *See* Opp. at 13. At this stage, it is sufficient that the FACC alleges such higher prices, *see* FACC ¶ 234, which – taken as true – clearly establishes antitrust injury to Class Plaintiffs. *See Allegheny Gen. Hosp. v. Philip Morris, Inc.*, 228 F.3d 429, 439 (3d Cir. 2000).²

The Court should deny Intel's motion to dismiss for the reasons stated in Class Plaintiffs' opposition. As discussed above, *Twombly* does not dictate otherwise.

19684.1\335790v1 2

Twombly did "not set forth a single fact in a context that suggests an agreement." 127 S. Ct. at 1969.

² Insofar as *Twombly* is premised on the fact that "proceeding to antitrust discovery can be expensive," 127 S. Ct. at 1967, it bears noting that discovery will continue – and will be expensive – with or without Class Plaintiffs, given the existence of AMD's own case against Intel.

Dated: June 4, 2007

PRICKETT JONES & ELLIOTT, P.A.

Michael D. Hausfeld

Daniel A. Small

Brent W. Landau

COHEN, MILSTEIN, HAUSFELD

& TOLL, P.L.L.C.

100 New York Avenue, NW

Suite 500, West Tower

Washington, DC 20005

Telephone:

(202) 408-4600

Facsimile:

(202) 408-4699

Michael P. Lehmann

Thomas P. Dove

Alex C. Turan

FURTH LEHMANN & GRANT LLP

225 Bush Street, 15th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94104

Telephone:

(415) 433-2070

Facsimile:

(415) 982-2076

Steven W. Berman

Anthony Shapiro

HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL

SHAPIRO, LLP

1301 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2900

Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone:

(206) 623-7292

Facsimile:

(206) 623-0594

Guido Saveri

R. Alexander Saveri

SAVERI & SAVERI, INC.

111 Pine Street, Suite 1700

San Francisco, CA 94111

Telephone:

(415) 217-6810

Facsimile:

(415) 217-6813

Interim Co-Lead Counsel for the Class Plaintiffs

By: James I. Holzman V

James L. Holzman (#663)

J. Clayton Athey (#4378)

∠aina M. Herbert (#4717)

1310 King Street, Box 1328

Wilmington, DE 19899

jlholzman@prickett.com

jcathey@prickett.com

lmherbert@prickett.com

Telephone:

(302) 888-6500

Facsimile:

(302) 658-8111

Interim Liaison Counsel for the Class

Plaintiffs

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, J. Clayton Athey, hereby certify that on this 4th day of June, 2007, I caused the foregoing Notice of Class Plaintiffs' Response to Defendant Intel Corporation's Supplemental Filing to be served on the following counsel via electronic filing:

Frederick L. Cottrell, III, Esquire
Chad Michael Shandler, Esquire
Steven J. Fineman, Esquire
Richards, Layton & Finger
One Rodney Square
P.O. Box 551
Wilmington, DE 19899
cottrell@rlf.com
shandler@rlf.com
fineman@rlf.com
Counsel for AMD International Sales &
Service LTD and Advanced Micro Devices,
Inc.

Adam L. Balick, Esquire
Bifferato Gentilotti Biden & Balick
711 North King Street
Wilmington, DE 19801-3503
abalick@bgbblaw.com
Counsel for AMD International Sales &
Service LTD and Advanced Micro Devices,
Inc.

Richard L. Horwitz, Esquire
W. Harding Drane, Jr., Esquire
Potter Anderson & Corroon, LLP
1313 N. Market St., Hercules Plaza, 6th Flr.
P.O. Box 951
Wilmington, DE 19899-0951
rhorwitz@potteranderson.com
wdrane@potteranderson.com
Counsel for Intel Corporation and Intel
Kabushiki Kaisha

Charles P. Diamond, Esquire
Mark A. Samuels, Esquire
Linda J. Smith, Esquire
O'Melveny & Myers LLP
1999 Avenue of the Stars, 7th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90067
CDiamond@omm.com
MSamuels@omm.com
lsmith@omm.com
Counsel for AMD International Sales &
Service LTD and Advanced Micro Devices,
Inc.

Laurin Grollman, Esquire
Salem M. Katsh, Esquire
Kasowitz, Benson, Torres & Friedman LLP
1633 Broadway
New York, New York 10019
lgrollman@kasowitz.com
skatsh@kasowitz.com
Counsel for AMD International Sales &
Service LTD and Advanced Micro Devices,
Inc.

David Mark Balabanian, Esquire Joy K. Fuyuno, Esquire Bingham McCutchen LLP Three Embarcadero Center San Francisco, CA 94111-4067 david.balabanian@bingham.com joy.fuyuno@bingham.com Counsel for Intel Corporation Christopher B. Hockett, Esquire Bingham McCutchen LLP Three Embarcadero Center San Francisco, CA 94111 chris.hockett@bingham.com Counsel for Intel Corporation

Daniel S. Floyd, Esquire Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP 333 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, California 90071-3197 dfloyd@gibsondunn.com Counsel for Intel Corporation

Robert E. Cooper, Esquire Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP 333 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, California 90071-3197 rcooper@gibsondunn.com Counsel for Intel Corporation

Donald F. Drummond, Esquire
Drummond & Associates
One California Street, Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94111
ballen@drummondlaw.net
Counsel for Dressed to Kill Custom Draperies
LLC, Jose Juan, Tracy Kinder and Edward
Rush

Darren B. Bernhard, Esquire
Peter E. Moll, Esquire
Howrey LLP
1299 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Bernhardd@howrey.com
Counsel for Intel Corporation and Intel
Kabushiki Kaisha

B.J. Wade, Esquire
Glassman Edwards Wade & Wyatt, P.C.
26 N. Second Street
Memphis, TN 38103
bwade@gewwlaw.com
Counsel for Cory Wiles

Nancy L. Fineman, Esquire Cotchett, Pitre, Simon & McCarthy 840 Malcolm Road, Suite 200 Burlingame, CA 94010 nfineman@cpsmlaw.com Counsel for Trotter-Vogel Realty Inc.

Robert D. Goldberg, Esquire
Biggs and Battaglia
921 North Orange Street, P.O. Box 1489
Wilmington, DE 19899
goldberg@batlaw.com
Counsel for Charles Dupraz, Vanessa Z.
DeGeorge, Melissa Goeke, Nancy Bjork,
James R. Conley, Jeff Vaught, Jim Kidwell
Richard Caplan, Virginia Deering, Ficor
Acquisition Co. LLC, Tom Hobbs, David
Kurzman, Leslie March, Andrew Marcus,
Paula Nardella, Bill Richards, Maria Pilar
Salgado, Ron Terranova, Nancy Wolft Ryan
James Volden and Carl Yamaguchi

Donald Chidi Amamgbo, Esquire Amamgbo & Associates, APC 1940 Embarcadero Cove Oakland, CA 94606 donaldamamgbo@citycom.com Counsel for Athan Uwakwe

jbutman@kellergrover.com

Counsel for David E. Lipton, Maria I. Prohias,
Patricia M. Niehaus, Peter Jon Naigow, Ronld
Konieczka, Steve J. Hamilton, Susan Baxley
and Kevin Stoltz

joseph M. Patane, Esquire

2280 Union Street

San Francisco, CA 94123

Jeffrey F. Keller, Esquire

Law Offices of Jeffrev F. Keller

Law Offices of Joseph M. Patane

425 Second Street, Suite 500

San Francisco, CA 94107

jkeller@jfkellerlaw.com

Jade Butman, Esquire

Gordon Ball, Esquire
Ball & Scott
550 W. Main Ave., Suite 750
Knoxville, TN 37902
gball@ballandscott.com
Counsel for Andrew Armbrister and Melissa
Armbrister

James Gordon McMillan, III, Esquire
Bouchard Margules & Friedlander
222 Delaware Avenue,
Suite 1400
Wilmington, DE 19801
jmcmillan@bmf-law.com
Counsel for Raphael Allison and Matthew
Kravitz

jpatane@tatp.com
Counsel for Karol Juskiewicz and Lawrence
Lang

Michele C. Jackson, Esquire
Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP
Embarcadero Center West, 275 Battery Street,
30th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
mjackson@lchb.com

Counsel for Huston Frazier, Jeanne Cook

A. Zachary Naylor, Esquire
Robert Kriner, Jr., Esquire
Robert R. Davis, Esquire
James R. Malone, Jr., Esquire
Chimicles & Tikellis, LLP
One Rodney Square, P.O. Box 1035
Wilmington, DE 19899
zacharynaylor@chimicles.com
robertkriner@chimicles.com
robertdavis@chimicles.com
jamesmalone@chimicles.com

Counsel for Gideon Elliott, Angel Genese, Nir Goldman, Paul C. Czysz, Elizabeth Bruderle Baran, Carrol Cowan, Russell Dennis, Damon DiMarco, Kathy Ann Chapman, Caresse Harms, JWRE Inc., Leonard Lorenzo, Michael E. Ludt, John Maita, Chrystal Moeller, Robert J. Rainwater, Mary Reeder, Stuart Schupler and Sonia Yaco

Ali Oromchian, Esquire
Finkelstein, Thompson & Loughran
601 Montgomery Street, Suite 665
San Francisco, CA 94111
ao@ftllaw.com
Counsel for Ian Walker, Damon DiMarco,
Carrol Cowan, Leonard Lorenzo and Russell
Dennis

Vincent J. Esades, Esquire
Muria J. Kruger, Esquire
Marguerite E. O'Brien, Esquire
Heins Mills & Olson, P.L.C.
3550 I.D.S. Center
80 S. Eight Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402
vesades@heinsmills.com
mkruger@heinsmills.com
mobrien@heinsmills.com
Counsel for Bergerson & Associates Inc.

Harry Shulman, Esquire
Robert Mills, Esquire
The Mills Law Firm
145 Marina Boulevard
San Rafeal, CA 94901
harry@millslawfirm.com
deepbluesky341@hotmail.com
Counsel for Stuart Munson

Douglas A. Millen, Esquire
Steven A. Kanner, Esquire
Much Shelist Freed Denenberg Ament &
Rubenstein, P.C.
191 North Wacker Drive, Suite 1800
Chicago, IL 60606
dmillen@muchshelist.com
skanner@muchshelist.com
Counsel for HP Consulting Services Inc. and
Phillip Boeding

Garrett D. Blanchfield, Jr., Esquire Mark Reinhardt, Esquire Reinhardt Wendorf & Blanchfield 332 Minnesota Street, Suite E-1250 St. Paul, MN 55101 g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com mreinhardt@comcast.net Counsel for Susan Baxley Hollis L. Salzman, Esquire Kellie Safar, Esquire

Goodking Labaton Rudoff & Sucharow, LLP

100 Park Avenue New York, NY 10017 hsalzman@labaton.com ksafar@labaton.com

Counsel for Angel Genese, Gideon Elliott and

Nir Goldman

Jason S. Kilene, Esquire Daniel E. Gustafson, Esquire Gustafson Gluek PLLC

650 Northstar East, 608 Second Avenue South

Minneapolis, MN 55402 jkilene@gustafsongluek.com dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com

Counsel for Fiarmont Orthopedics & Sports

Medicine PA

Lance A. Harke, Esquire

Harke & Clasby 155 S. Miami Avenue Miami, FL 33130 lharke@harkeclasby.com

Counsel for Nathaniel Schwartz and Maria I.

Prohias

Bruce J. Wecker, Esquire Hosie McArthur LLP One Market Street Spear Street Tower #2200

San Francisco, CA 94105 bwecker@hosielaw.com

Counsel for Dwight E. Dickerson

Francis O. Scarpulla, Esquire Law Offices of Francis O. Scarpulla 44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400

San Francisco, CA 94104

foslaw@pacbell.net

Counsel for Lazio Family Products, Law Offices of Laurel Stanley, William F. Cronin, Michael Brauch and Andrew Meimes

R. Bruce McNew, Esquire Taylor & McNew, LLP 3711 Kennett Pike, Suite 210 Greenville, DE 19807

mcnew@taylormcnew.com Counsel for Robert Marshall

Ian Otto, Esquire Nathan Cihlar, Esquire Straus & Boies, LLP

4041 University Drive, 5th Floor

Fairfax, VA 22030 dboies@straus-boies.com

Counsel for Dressed to Kill Custom Draperies LLC, Jose Juan, Edward Rush and Tracy

Kinder

Allan Steyer, Esquire

Stever Lowenthal Boodrookas Alvarez &

Smith LLP

One California Street, Third Floor

San Francisco, CA 94111 asteyer@steyerlaw.com

Counsel for Cheryl Glick-Salpeter, Salpeter, Jodi Salpeter and Michael H. Roach

Mario Nunzio Alioto, Esquire

Trump Alioto Trump & Prescott LLP

2280 Union Street

San Francisco, CA 94123

malioto@tatp.com

Counsel for Karol Juskiewicz and Lawrence

Lang

Steven A. Asher, Esquire

Robert S. Kitchenoff, Esquire

Weinstein Kitchenoff & Asher, LLC 1845 Walnut Street, Suite 1100

Philadelphia, PA 19103

asher@wka-law.com kithenoff@wka-law.com

Counsel for Joseph Samuel Cone

Francis A. Bottini, Jr., Esquire Wolf Haldenstein Adler Freeman & Herz 750 B Street, Suite2770 San Diego, CA 92101 bottini@whafh.com

Counsel for Ryan James Volden, Ficor Acquisition Co LLC, Giacobbe-Fritz Fine Art LLC, Andrew Marcus, Bill Richards, Carl Yamaguchi, Charles Dupraz, David Kurzman, James R. Conley, Jeff Vaught, John Matia, Kathy Ann Chapman, Caresse Harms, JWRE Inc., Jim Kidwell, John Maita, Leslie March, Maria Pilar Salgado, Melissa Goeke, Nancy Bjork, Nancy Wolfe, Paula Nardella, Richard Caplan, Ron Terranova, Tom Hobbs, Vanessa Z. DeGeorge, Virginia Deering, Chrystal Moeller, Robert J. Rainwater, Mary Reeder and Sonia Yaco

Edward A. Wallace, Esquire The Wexler Firm LLP One N. LaSalle Street, Suite 2000 Chicago, IL 60602 eawallace@wexlerfirm.com Counsel for Peter Jon Naigow

Jason S. Hartley, Esquire
Ross, Dixon & Bell LLP
550 West B Street, Suite 400
San Diego, CA 92101
jhartley@rdblaw.com
Counsel for Gabriella Herroeder-Perras

Fred Taylor Isquith, Esquire
Adam J. Levitt, Esquire
Wolf Haldenstein Adler Freeman & Herz
270 Madison Ave., 11th Floor
New York, NY 10016
isquith@whafh.com
levitt@whafh.com

Counsel for Ryan James Volden, Ficor Acquisition Co LLC, Giacobbe-Fritz Fine Art LLC, Andrew Marcus, Bill Richards, Carl Yamaguchi, Charles Dupraz, David Kurzman, James R. Conley, Jeff Vaught, John Matia, Kathy Ann Chapman, Caresse Harms, JWRE Inc., Jim Kidwell, John Maita, Leslie March, Maria Pilar Salgado, Melissa Goeke, Nancy Bjork, Nancy Wolfe, Paula Nardella, Richard Caplan, Ron Terranova, Tom Hobbs, Vanessa Z. DeGeorge, Virginia Deering, Chrystal Moeller, Robert J. Rainwater, Mary Reeder and Sonia Yaco

Jeffrey S. Goddess, Esquire
Rosenthal, Monhait, Gross & Goddess
Mellon Bank Center, Suite 1401
P.O. Box 1070
Wilmington, DE 19899
jgoddess@rmgglaw.com
Counsel for Ludy A. Chacon, Joseph Samuel
Cone. Darice Russ and Michael K. Simon

Craig C. Corbitt, Esquire
Zelle, Hofmann, Voelbel, Mason & Gette LLP
44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3400
San Francisco, CA 94104
ccorbitt@zelle.com
Counsel for William F. Cronin, Law Offices of
Laurel Stanley and Lazio Family Products

Eugene A. Spector, Esquire
William G. Caldes, Esquire
Spector Roseman & Kodroff, P.C.
Suite 2500
1818 Market Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
espector@srk-law.com
bcaldes@srk-law.com
Counsel for David Arnold, Andrew S. Cohn,
Jason Craig, Maria Griffin, Lena K. Manyin,
Paul Ramos and Michael Ruccolo

Scott E. Chambers, Esquire
Schmittinger & Rodriguez, P.A.
414 S. State Street
P.O. Box 497
Dover, DE 19903
Counsel for David Arnold, Andrew S. Cohn,
Jason Craig, Maria Griffin, Lena K. Manyin,
Paul Ramos and Michael Ruccolo

Juden Justice Reed, Esquire Schubert & Reed LLP Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 1600 San Francisco, CA 94111 <u>jreed@schubert-reed.com</u> Counsel for Patrick J. Hewson

Russell M. Aoki, Esquire Aoki Sakamoto Grant LLP One Convention Place 701 Pike Street, Suite 1525 Seattle, WA 98101 russ@aoki-sakamoto.com Counsel for Kevin Stoltz

Richard A. Ripley, Esquire Bingham McCutchen 1120 20th Street, NW, Suite 800 Washington, DC 20036 richard.ripley@bingham.com Counsel for Intel Corporation

Donald L. Perelman, Esquire Fine Kaplan & Black, RPC 1835 Market Street, 28th Flr Philadelphia, PA 19103 dperelman@finekaplan.com Counsel for Kevin Stoltz Natalie Finkelman Bennett, Esquire Shepherd, Finkelman, Miller & Shah 65 Main Street Chester, CT 06412-1311 nfinkelman@classactioncounsel.com Counsel for Ludy A. Chacon

Michael L. Kirby, Esquire Kirby Noonan Lance & Hoge LLP One America Plaza 600 West Broadway, Suite 1100 San Diego, CA 92101 mkirby@knlh.com Counsel for Justin Suarez

Jeffrey A. Bartos, Esquire Guerrieri, Edmond, Clayman & Bartos, PC 1625 Massachusetts Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20036 jbartos@geclaw.com Counsel for Jose Juan, Dressed to Kill Custom Draperies, LLC, Tracy Kinder and Edward Rush

Randy R. Renick, Esquire
Law Offices of Randy Renick
128 North Fair Oaks Avenue, Suite 204
Pasadena, CA 91103
rrr@renicklaw.com
Counsel for Shanghai 1930 Restaurant
Partners L.P. and Major League Softball Inc.

Daniel Hume, Esquire
Kirby McInerney & Squire LLP
830 Third Avenue, 10th Floor
New York, NY 10022
dhume@kmslaw.com
Counsel for Raphael Allison and Matthew
Kravitz

Scott Ames, Esquire
Serratore & Ames
9595 Wilshire Blvd., Suite 201
Los Angeles, CA 90212
scott@serratoreames.com
Counsel for Major League Softball, Inc.

Douglas G. Thompson, Jr., Esquire Finkelstein, Thompson & Loughran 1050 30th Street N.W. Washington, DC 20007 dgt@ftllaw.com Counsel for Ian Walker, Damon DiMarco, Carrol Cowan, Leonard Lorenzo and Russell Dennis

Reginald Von Terrell, Esquire The Terrell Law Group 223 25th Street Richmond, CA 94804 REGGIET2@aol.com Counsel for Athan Uwakwe Daniel B. Allanoff, Esquire
Steven Greenfogel, Esquire
Meredith Cohen Greenfogel & Skirnick, P.C.
22nd Floor, Architects Building
117 S. 17th Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
dallanoff@mcgslaw.com
sgreenfogel@mcgslaw.com
Counsel for Benjamin Allanoff

Harvey W. Gurland, Jr., Esquire Duane Morris 200 S. Biscayne Blvd., Suite 3400 Miami, FL 33131 HWGurland@duanemorris.com Counsel for Intel Corporation

Barbara C. Frankland, Esquire Rex A. Sharp, Esquire Gunderson Sharp & Walke, L.L.P. 5301 W. 75th Street Prairie Village, KS 66208 <u>bfrankland@midwest-law.com</u> <u>rsharp@midwest-law.com</u> Counsel for Marvin D. Chance, Jr.

J. Clayton Athey (Bar ID #4378)